

Book Review Seminar on Professor Tao's *When Christianity Met the Religions of China and Japan* held at Academia Sinica*

Chaired by Senior Professor Li Ming-hui 李明輝, a book review seminar on Professor Tao Demin's 陶德民 latest work, *When Christianity Met the Religions of China and Japan: From Ritual Bowing to Questions of Dignity and Faith* 西教東漸と中日事情-拝礼・尊嚴・信念をめぐる文化交渉 (Research series No. 57 of the Institute of Oriental and Occidental Studies, Kansai University, March 2019), was held at the Academia Sinica's Institute of Chinese Literature and Philosophy in Taipei on July 19, 2019.

Professor Tao received his PhD in Literature from Osaka University and PhD in Cultural Interaction Studies from Kansai University, and worked as a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Reischauer Institute of Japanese Studies at Harvard University and a Shibusawa Eiichi Research Fellow. He taught at Bridgewater State University, Massachusetts in the early 1990s, and since 1996 has served in the Faculty of Letters of Kansai University in Osaka, Japan. He is the author of *A Study of Kaitokudō Neo-Confucianism* 懷徳堂朱子学の研究, *The Meiji Sinologists and China* 明治の漢学者と中国, and *The Origins of Modern Japanese Sinology* 日本における近代中国学の始まり, and is a coeditor of the *Dictionary of Modern Japanese Persons Involved with China* 近代日中関係史人名辞典, *Selected Works of Samuel Wells Williams* 卫三畏文集, and *The Tokugawa World*.

The history of religious conflicts between Christianity, Confucianism, Buddhism, Islam and Shintoism in early modern and modern East Asia has been a central area of interest in Prof. Tao's work. Using a series of historical pictures from the book as a visual introduction, Tao presented a brief background lecture at the beginning of the seminar. He confessed that his motiva-



* Edited and translated by Zhang Zikang 張子康 and revised by Tao Demin based on the report of the seminar, 「近世近代儒教和基督教交渉の歴史經驗的反思——《西教東漸と中日事情》的成書背景之介紹」紀要 written by Zhan Yi-ying 詹宜穎, with permission by the Committee for Promotion of Ming-Qing Studies, Academia Sinica. http://mingching.sinica.edu.tw/Academic_Detail/786

tion for writing the book could be traced back to “9/11”; arriving at the Reischauer Institute on precisely September 11, 2001 as a Visiting Fellow, he learned of the attack on the World Trade Center in New York through televised reports, and was shocked by the vivid scene of smoke billowing from the windows. Later, when President George W. Bush declared war on terrorism and used the word “crusade” to justify the invasion of Iraq, he believed that the clash of civilizations in the post-Cold War world due to the different religious faiths, as predicted by Samuel P. Huntington (1927-2008) in the early 1990s, had now become a harsh reality. Coming back after sabbatical, Tao introduced the progressive opinions of Harvard professors Iriye Akira and Tu Weiming to Director Wakata Kyōji of the Institute of Legal Studies, Kansai University. The Director was delighted to invite the two professors to the 25th and 26th “Seminars in Modern Law” held in July and November 2002, where they gave lectures on the “International Community” and “Dialogue Among Civilizations” respectively. Professor Tao himself began to examine the major historical experiences of religious conflicts between the West and East Asia, and felt increasingly that an alarm needed sounding, namely that in the face of the crises of global warming, the spread of deadly pathogens and even nuclear wars, peoples of the world should try to break away from the traditional model of “rivalry and interdependence” (相生相克) in international relations and explore possible paths to building a global village of “empathy and coexistence” (共感共存).

The term 西教東漸 (*seikyō tōzen* / *xijiao dongjian*) in the book title was coined in 1949 by Saeki Yoshirō 佐伯好郎 (1871-1965), a prominent scholar specializing in the history of Christianity in China; the phrase literally means “the eastward dissemination of Western religions”. Professor Tao reactivated this little-known term to make a sharp contrast with the frequently-used term 西学東漸 (*seigaku tōzen* / *xixue dongjian*) (“the eastward dissemination of Western learning”) so as to emphasize that not “all things Western” should be understood as exclusively “Western property”; Western religions, for example, have constituted serious creative challenges to Eastern peoples. “Western religion” in this book, moreover, refers not only to Christianity, but also to Buddhism, which came much earlier from India (*Tenjiku* / *Tianzhu*) and constituted the first serious challenge to the traditional religions of China and Japan, resulting in a more or less happy marriage after a thousand years of religious and cultural interaction. But Christianity, in both its Catholic and Protestant forms, is still very much in the process of contestation and partial adoption by native religious cultures in East Asia; this gradual nativization of Christian monotheism is likely to take much longer than that of Buddhism, which itself took almost a thousand years from the Han to the Song dynasties.

In addition, Professor Tao's book title *Seikyō tōzen* 西教東漸と中日事情 was also designated intentionally to be linked with the book *Seigaku tōzen to chugoku jijo* 西学東漸と中国事情 written by Masuda Wataru 増田渉, his predecessor in the same Department of Chinese Studies at Kansai University, who was fortunate to be given weekly private lectures on the history of the Chinese novels by Lu Xun 鲁迅 at his home in Shanghai for a period of nine months in 1931.

The book contains three parts. The first treats the "Rites Controversy" between the Kangxi emperor and Pope Clement XI, and the generally positive experiences of exposure to and appreciation of different religions and cultures as exemplified by the amicable relations between Wang Tao and his two missionary bosses, Walter H. Medhurst in Shanghai and James Legge in Hong Kong. Competing views of a legitimate "National Religion" for the new Republic of China in the early 1910s are also discussed. The second part examines the tensions between Christianity and "New Religion" in the Meiji period. The term "New Religion" (translated into Japanese as *chukun aikoku kyō* 忠君愛国教) was coined by Tokyo Imperial University professor Basil H. Chamberlain (1850-1935) in his *Things Japanese* for criticizing Japan's god-making movement from 1890 to 1935, which he had witnessed and followed right up to his death.

One important discovery made by Professor Tao at the Central Library of Metropolitan Tokyo was the prominent German-trained ideologue Inoue Tetsujirō's 井上哲次郎 (1855-1944) critical comments, written in the *Kei bunshu* 敬字文集, anthology of Nakamura Masanao 中村正直, a leading Confucian and Methodist educator and an admirer of English liberalism and constitutional monarchy. While Nakamura once suggested that Emperor Meiji convert to Christianity to show an example of determination in adopting Western civilization, Inoue, as the officially appointed annotator of Emperor Meiji's "Imperial Rescript on Education" of 1890, called for restricting the "extraterritoriality in the spiritual world" enjoyed by Christians in Japan, and launched an attack on such influential Christian leaders as Uchimura Kanzō 内村鑑三. This part also includes an article on Kurita Hiroshi 栗田寛, a deadly foe of Christianity and the leader of the Mito school who had written provocative Shinto-related chapters which brought the 200-year project of compiling *A Grand History of Japan* 大日本史 (*Dai-Nihon shi*) to completion in 1906. There is also an impressive piece discussing the causes and consequences of Shintoist, Buddhist, and Christian Leaders' Meetings for Reconciliation (三教会同), which meant that the legitimacy of Christianity was officially recognized by such open-minded government leaders as Premier Saionji Kinmochi, Home Minister Hara Takashi and Vice-Minister Tokonami Takejirō 床次竹二郎. The significance of the founding of Association

Accordia 帰一協会 by Shibusawa Eiichi 渋沢栄一 (1840-1931) and other men of insight is also discussed in this context. Both events happened in early 1912, which symbolized the beginning of the rise of progressivism and democracy in the Taishō period (1912-1926).

The third part of the book explores the transformation of views of civilizations and theories of politics under Western influence, as well as the enduring spirit of adhering to traditional Japanese values and cultural heritage.

Professor Tao concluded his lecture with three lessons drawn from the history of cultural interaction between Christianity, Confucianism and Shintoism. First, the ignorance of global geography and history, the lack of linguistic knowledge and communications technology, and divergent cultural backgrounds have significantly hindered mutual understanding between Eastern and Western peoples. But as the undisputable fact that the “Rites Controversy” was finally solved after 220 years in 1939 by Pope Pius XII’s approval of Confucian ritual among Chinese Catholics shows, although it takes time to overcome many difficulties, mutual understanding at different levels is possible. Second, it is understandable that a new religion was invented and the god-making movement was promoted for strengthening national identity and solidarity in Japan in order to withstand the unprecedented power of Western impact in the Meiji period, but if things go to the other extreme, namely of claiming the supremacy of the Japanese race and imperial system, then this will inevitably lead to a new round of fierce confrontation and even military clashes, as indicated by the harsh reality of the Second World War.

Thirdly, from the Association Accordia’s leader Shibusawa Eiichi’s efforts for enhancing mutual understanding between Confucianism and Christianity, as well as the China-based English missionary publisher Timothy Richard’s 李提摩太 (1845-1917) promotion of a “Common Religion for Peoples of the Globe” 地球通教 based on the essence of Confucianism, Taoism, Buddhism, and Christianity, we can see an emerging quest for spiritual universality in terms of religious beliefs and ethical values already a hundred years ago, one which could provide us with stimulating hints for building a global village of “empathy and coexistence” (共感共存) in our own time.

After the lecture, Professor Tien Shih-min (田世民) of Taiwan University, who served as the commentator at the seminar, said that the book, with its hundred-plus pictures and solid historical materials organically connected over eleven chapters, offered a “broad panorama” which would help readers to expand their historical and conceptual understanding of cultural interaction between the religions of East and West. Professor Tien summarized the contents of each chapter with particular attention to Chapter 4, which

described Japanese responses to Western impact (including the invention of the National system of Shinto shrines, the promotion of Emperor worship to unify the citizenry, and Kurita Hiroshi's argument that "the world is the world of the emperor", including his reconstruction, after the victory of the 1894-95 Sino-Japanese War, of an East Asian history with the Japanese Emperor as the top ruler in a fictitious hierarchical tributary system). In addition, Chapter 8 presented case studies of Shigeno Yasutsugu 重野安繹, and Nakamura Masanao, follow students at the Shogunate's Confucian College and later professors at Tokyo Imperial University who played pioneering roles in the reception of Western learning while still maintaining a strong faith in Chinese culture. Shigeno and Nakamura believed the value of Confucianism and Chinese experience should not be underestimated, and was worthy of selective adoption even in a climate of Western domination. Their examples revealed that positive views about cultural diversity still existed among the leading intellectuals of the day, and made a sharp contrast with the popular argument of "Break-off with Asian Neighbors" 脱亜論 (Datsu-A ron) advocated by the radical thinker Fukusawa Yukichi.

Professor Lin Yuehui 林月惠, a leading scholar of Neo-Confucianism with a focus on comparative research on Sino-Korean Confucianisms, raised three questions. The first concerned the meaning of the expression "Conflicts between Education and Religion" 教育宗教衝突 in the title of Chapter 5; the second was about the meaning of "extraterritoriality in the spiritual world;" and the third concerned the localization of Christianity in prewar Japan. Professor Tao replied in three parts. First, "Conflicts between Education and Religion" is a condensed expression of the book title of Inoue Tetsujirō's *Kyōiku to Shūkyō no shōtotsu* 教育と宗教の衝突, published in April 1893, which sparked a heated debate in newspapers and journals which, if dated from an earlier public comment on the relationship between education and religion by Inoue in November 1892, continued in earnest for almost a full year. These exchanges were collected in a three-volume series in October 1893, with *Dr. Inoue and Christians* 井上博士と基督教徒 as its main title and *Kyōiku to Shūkyō no shōtotsu* as its subtitle. From the context, therefore, it is clear that the word "education" here is an abbreviation of the "Imperial Rescript on Education" promulgated in October 1890, and that the "religion" in question is "Christianity."

The phrase "extraterritoriality in the spiritual world", meanwhile, could be traced back to early modern times. Because of the influence of Francisco Xavier, the Catholic Church gained hundreds of thousands of converts in southern Japan at the turn of the 16th century, which threatened Toyotomi Hideyoshi and the subsequent Tokugawa rulers, and finally led to the Shimabara Revolt of 1837-1838. After the religious force was put down, the

Tokugawa Shogunate proclaimed a strict isolation policy, ordering all families to register with a local Buddhist temple and prohibiting overseas travel. In addition, the “Fumi-e” method was used to hunt for “hidden Catholics” or “*kakure kirishitan*” 隠れキリシタン. That is, if a suspect hesitated to step on the wooden or copper block on which a likeness of Jesus or St. Mary was printed, he or she would be identified as a Catholic convert. Likewise, Protestantism enjoyed a speedy expansion in the early Meiji period after the opening of Japan for foreign trade in 1859 and the Iwakura Embassy’s promise of lifting the ban on Christianity in exchange for Western powers’ agreement on the revision of the unequal treaties in 1873. In view of the rapidly increased numbers of Protestant converts, the government decided to make full use of Emperor Meiji’s authority in the sacred form of the “Imperial Rescript on Education” to cope with the problem. The expression “extraterritoriality in the spiritual world” came from Inoue’s autobiography, written in his last years during World War II; the expression sums up his life-long fight with Christian influence. Inoue had praised some Japanese priests for their independent management of Christian churches, but in general he considered Christianity as a monotheism which constituted a serious spiritual challenge to the Japanese nation. His attack on Christianity had significantly subdued Japanese Christian leaders, who became increasingly afraid of being seen as “unpatriotic and disloyal to the Emperor.” It is no exaggeration to say that the major reason that Christians only constitute 1.1% of the Japanese population today was due to Inoue’s desperate and enduring efforts over half a century as an educator and ideologue. However, at the turn of the 20th century, as Japan sought to become a fully modernized nation, many intellectuals argued that if the country hoped to advance further, it had to adopt the spiritual civilization of the West, with Christianity as its backbone. As a result, the aforementioned Shintoist, Buddhist, and Christian Leaders’ Meetings for Reconciliation were held, and the Association Accordia was founded in 1912. The major members of the Association Accordia continued to exert influence in religious and educational circles, and finally worked out an “Official Notice” with the Ministry of Education in 1935 for directing all schools to initiate a new kind of spiritual education program which could comprise religious elements including those of Christianity. Because international tensions were intensifying at the time, however, this liberal program was unable to be put into practice. Nevertheless, it is apparent that many prominent thinkers and educators in modern Japan were Protestants who played a key role in guiding the Japanese people on their march toward liberal democratic institutions.

Philosophy Professor Huang Kuan-min 黃冠閔, the Vice-Director of the Institute, asked a series of questions, ranging from the deep reason for the

Tokugawa officials' request that foreign diplomats perform ritual bowing to the Confucian statue in the Shogunal College, to the position and influence of Confucius and Confucianism in the Japanese national polity, value systems, and state ritual, and other stimulating questions worthy of further exploration.



