Opinion Forum

Turning Stone into Gold:
Some Reflections on My Research about the 1854 Shōin-Perry Encounter

De-min TAO*

When Yoshikawa Kōjirō 吉川幸次郎 (1904–1980), a prominent scholar of Kyoto University known for teaching Chinese literature in spoken Mandarin, was writing a critical biography of the Sinologue Ogyū Sorai 萩生徂徠 (1666–1728), he commented that Sorai was a linguist when he was young, a literary man in his middle ages, and a philosopher in his later years. After three decades of research, I found the comment to be a great inspiration, reminding me that I should now try to be a bit more philosophical so as to refine and sublimate my scholarship and share my experience with students in an memorable way. In this spirit, I developed the following four-line instruction set that I call “Shihai shibei” 史海拾貝 (Collecting shells from the sea of history), based mainly on my research about the 1854 Shōin-Perry encounter at Yale, the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA), based in Washington, D.C., and Tokyo. This instruction set incorporates several well-known Chinese and Japanese proverbs:

(1) 就著碎影拼月亮, 自圓其說。
(2) 大海撈針何處尋, 巧思引路。
(3) 兩個兔子輪番追, 有心插柳。
(4) 問題意識勤磨練, 點石成金。

The following is a brief translation:
(1) Make your moon whole from partial fragments; justify your claims.
(2) It is hard to fish a needle out of the ocean; use creative thinking to lead the way.
(3) Chase two rabbits in turn; plant a willow with purpose.
(4) Refine your awareness of the question itself; touch a stone and turn it into gold.

* Professor, Kansai University; Founding President of the Society.
For the story I am going to tell today, I will change the sequence to (3), (2), (4), and (1).

1 Taking the Second Rabbit Seriously: Shōin’s Petitions kept at Yale

There is a Japanese proverb 二兎を追う者は一兎を得ず, meaning “One who chases two rabbits at the same time catches neither.” But my experience tells me that you should chase two rabbits in turn—the first rabbit being the research topic planned at the outset, and the second rabbit being the interesting materials that you unexpectedly encounter when doing the actual research—so as not to discount the accidental discoveries that you make in pursuing your original topic.

In a sense, my discovery of Shōin’s petitions at Yale was accidental. I came to Yale in the spring of 2003 to find the original diary of Luo Sen 羅森 (1821–1899), Chinese assistant to Samuel Wells Williams (1812–1884). As you may know, kanbun (classical Chinese), the Latin of East Asia, was the language of negotiation in the days of Japan’s opening, both for the U. S.-Japan treaty and for Shōin’s attempted stowaway. Although by 1853 Williams had been in Hong Kong and Macau for 20 years and was familiar with the Chinese language, as the first interpreter, he still needed Chinese assistants to help him polish diplomatic documents and copy them into elegant calligraphy. Luo was recruited shortly before Perry’s second visit in 1854 and kept a diary during the encounters. He published his Riben riji 日本
日記 in the earliest Chinese journal, the *Xiaer guanzhen* 遐邇貫珍 (Chinese Serial), shortly after returning to Hong Kong, and its English translation, *Journal of a Visit to Japan* by Williams, was included in the second volume of *Narrative of the Expedition of an American Squadron to the China Seas and Japan: Performed in the Years 1852, 1853, and 1854, under the Command of Commodore M. C. Perry, United States Navy, by Order of the Government of the United States*, edited by Francis L. Hawks.

Through a close comparison, I found an important difference between the two published versions of the diary. Many Japanese then were wondering why a Chinese man joined the American expedition to Japan. Luo had a long written conversation 筆談 with Hirayama Kenjirō 平山謙二郎, a metsuke 目付 (surveillance officer), in which Hirayama shared Confucian knowledge and contemporary concerns with Luo. In this conversation, Luo made it clear that although he had organized a militia group to fight against the British soldiers during the Opium Wars of 1839 to 1842, his efforts were not rewarded afterwards by the Qing government. He was so angry about this that he left his hometown in Nanhai county, Guangdong Province, to go to Hong Kong and serve as a Chinese teacher and secretary in the new British colony. But this story, which was included in Williams’s translation, was missing in Luo’s *Riben riji*, and the reason for this was apparently that Luo would occasionally visit his hometown and relatives there, and was cautious about possible trouble that the Qing government might give him if the Chinese version included the truth, and so he decided to cut it out before submitting the diary to the publisher of *Xiaer guanzhen*.

This discovery made me wonder if there were other differences between the English and Chinese versions, and I tried to find Luo’s original handwritten diary or a copy in the S. W. Williams Family Papers at Yale. Although I did not find what I was looking for, I did find Shōin’s *kanbun* petitions, “Tōisho” 投夷書 (Letters to Foreigners), including the well-prepared first letter submitted to the American side seeking to stow away (accompa-
nied by a *sōrōbun* 候文 note beginning with the famous sentence “We two want to see the world”), and the second letter written in the Shimoda jail.

---

3 In March 2016, Kansai University Press will publish a volume that includes Hirayama’s collected works in Chinese (held by Hokkaido University Library), the written information he got from Luo, *Manshin kiji* 満清紀事 (held by Kansai University Library), his 1854 diary kept during the investigation of Ezochi 蠟夷地 (Hokkaido) and Sōya Strait 宗谷海峡, and a diary kept by two prison guards who escorted Shōin from Shimoda jail to Edo in 1854 (both part of the materials on the aftermath of the Meiji Restoration, held by the Historiographical Institute of the University of Tokyo). I will begin editing and annotating them in the coming summer.

4 I have made a thorough textual examination of the two petitions in the following
(See the appendix of this paper.) The first petition was discovered forty years ago by Yamaguchi Eitetsu 山口栄鉄, a Japanese instructor at Yale, and the second one was discovered by me on my 2003 visit to Yale. The interesting fact here is that although the petition was carefully pasted on the inside of the back cover of S. W. Williams’s journal to keep a record of the unusual incident, the importance of this document was unknown to his son, Yale Professor of East Asian History Frederic Wells Williams, who did not include it in A Journal of the Perry Expedition to Japan (1853–1854) (1889) or in his father’s biography, The Life and Letters of Samuel Wells Williams, LL.D.: Missionary, Diplomatist, Sinologue (1910).

According to my examination of their calligraphic and prose styles, the sōrōbun note was in Shōin’s own handwriting, whereas the two kanbun petitions were fair copies made by Luo Sen at Williams’s direction, and in this sense, my discovery at Yale was not completely accidental. The second petition was originally written on a wooden board when Shōin and his fellow stowaway Kaneko were confined in the Shimoda jail in a small cage. Its

articles: “Shimoda mikkō zengo ni okeru Shōin no Seiyō ninshiki: Beikoku ni nokoru ‘Tōisho’ o megutte” 下田密航前後における松陰の西洋認識: 米国に残る「投夷書」をめぐって (Shōin’s Understanding of the West around the Time of His Stowaway: The ‘Letters to Foreigners’ in the United States), Kan 環 13 (May 2003); “Shimada goku ni okeru daini no ‘Tōisho’ ni tsuite: Shōin no kakugo ni taisuru Perī no kyōkan” 下田獄における第二の「投夷書」について: 松陰の覚悟に対するペリーの共感 (The Second ‘Letter to Foreigners’ from the Shimoda Jail: Perry’s Sympathy toward Shōin’s Determination), Kan 環 14 (July 2003); “Ri-Mei jianjiao zhi chuyi zhuang toudu gongan de xin jiedu: Jitian Songyin ‘Touyishu’ zai Yelu Daxue danganguan faxian” 日美建交之初一樁偷渡公案的新解読: 吉田松陰〈投夷書〉在耶魯大學檔案館發現 (A New Interpretation of the First Stowaway Case at the Dawn of Japan-U.S. Relations: The Discovery of Yoshida Shōin’s “Letter to Foreigners” in the Yale University Archives), Dongya Wenming Yanjiu Zhongxin tongxun (National Taiwan University), no. 6 (January 2005).

5 An Okinawa-born leading scholar in the history of Ryūkyū’s foreign relations, Professor Yamaguchi introduced the petition under the title “Nemutteita Shōin no missho” 眠っていた松陰の密書 (Shōin’s Sleeping Secret Letter) (Rekishi to jinbutsu 1975, no. 10). Recently he supervised the publication of a complete reprint of the 3-volume Narrative.

6 The petition was considered “a remarkable specimen of philosophical resignation under circumstances which would have tried the stoicism of Cato, [and] deserves a record” (Hawkes, Narrative, 1: 422). From the comparison made with Cato Minor (95−46 BCE), the tragic hero who committed suicide in Utica, Africa, rather than falling alive into Caesar’s hands, it seems that the Americans were deeply affected by Shōin’s “letter on the board” and deeply concerned about his fate. The size of the cage, as Williams measured it, “was about six feet long by three wide and four and a half high, quite large enough to sit and sleep in, and entered by crawling through a low door; it is probably just such a cage as McCoy and his fellows were at last shut up in” (Journal 1: 181−182). Isaac McCoy (1784−1846) was a Baptist missionary, surveyor and U.S. Indian agent, and the association by similarity made
English translation by Williams was included in the first volume of the *Narrative*, and there have been seven Japanese translations based on the English without any knowledge of the *kanbun* original, from Tokutomi Sohō’s 1908 biography of Shōin to the 2002 Japanese translation of J. Willett Spalding’s *Japan Expedition: Japan and around the World*. After discovering the *kanbun* original, I found a critical mistake made by Williams that was inherited by all the Japanese versions.

2 Fishing a Needle Out of the Ocean: The Logbook of Perry’s Flagship at NARA

A Chinese proverb 大海撈針 compares the difficulty of a situation by comparing it to fishing a needle out of the ocean. The mistranslation by Williams was in the sentence “In public have we been seized and pinioned and caged for many days.” Here the original word 面縛 (*mianfu* in Chinese and *menbaku* in Japanese) is short for 面縛輿櫬 *mianfu yuchen*, meaning “to tie one’s hands at the back and cart along one’s coffin before the victor” and implying “to submit.” Williams translated 面縛 as “in public have we been seized,” as if Shōin and his fellow were caught during the daytime.

Shōin’s *Kaikoroku* 回顧録 (Memoirs), written in the Noyama jail of the Hagi domain, made it clear, however, that after being sent ashore, Shōin and Hirayama, unable to find the boat they used to access the flagship, which contained some incriminating evidence, decided to turn themselves in to the village head of Kakizaki and were brought to the Shimoda police box shortly after the crack of dawn. The word 面縛 was used exactly in this sense, to turn oneself in.

But one problem still remained unresolved: When did Shōin actually climb aboard Perry’s flagship, and how long did he remain on board? Shōin recalled that it was around 4 a.m. (”七つ時”), whereas Williams, who was present at the interview with Shōin, noted “2 a.m.” in his journal. When I was traveling to NARA in Washington, D.C., in the spring of 2009 to find Williams’s original letter to the Secretary of State suggesting using the surplus of the indemnity paid by the Qing government for the property loss of American citizens in China during the Arrow War to establish an American-Chinese college in China, an idea occurred to me: Why don’t I use this chance to take a look at the logbook of Perry’s flagship, the USS Powhatan, to see if there are any relevant records in it?7 Fortunately, I was

---

7 Williams’s suggestion was aimed at training interpreters, diplomats, and businessmen to foster American-Chinese relations, and it was approved by the State Department.
able to find Captain William J. McCluney’s brief note, as follows:

Remarks of This 25th Day of April, 1854
Commences at 2:45 two Japanese came on board by a small boat, remained about 3/4 of an hour, on getting aboard their boat got drifted & they were sent ashore by the S’ [steamer’s] cutter by order of the Commo. [Commodore].

Shōin’s attempt at stowaway was thus identified with a specific duration of time: forty-five minutes on board the flagship. His self-submission and asking for punishment can thus be reasonably explained as occurring in this sequence of time. Some may discount the importance of discoveries of this kind. Isn’t this merely a trivial pursuit of Shōin’s time on board? However, imagine the huge difference in time systems between Japan and West then. Thus, since Shōin had no way to make an appointment with the American officers due to the difference, he even wrote in another sōrōbun note, “Please come to rescue us when you see the fire we light as a sign at midnight tomorrow.” Such drama gives one a better sense of the turbulence of the times when the West came into contact with the East. Salvaging an important lost historical record conveys the feeling of real history to today’s digitized generation and helps us relive some exciting events that happened in the past.

Line (2) thus acknowledges the difficulty that researchers may encounter when trying to sift through a sea of information to find the most useful pieces of evidence, but at the same time, it gives hope that improving one’s linguistic abilities, one’s ability to use sources, and one’s creative imagination will help to break through this formidable barrier.

3 Turning Stone into Gold: Humanitarian Concerns Mattered in the Age of Gunboat Diplomacy

The Chinese proverb 點石成金 means “To touch a stone and turn it into gold.” If we look back at the history of research in certain areas or fields, we find that a major change in perspective can bring about a totally different view of the same historic figure, incident, or time period.

In two articles I published in Hong Kong and Tokyo, in 2003 and 2009 and President Lincoln, but was denied by Congress.

8 Tao De-min 陶徳民, “Perī no kikan ni nobotta Shōin no ‘jikan’ ni semaru: Pouhatan-gō no kōkai nisshi ni mita Shimoda mikkō kanren kiji ni tsuite” ペリーの旗艦に登った松陰の「時間」に迫る: ポウハタン号の航海日誌に見た下田密航関連記事について (Closing in on Shōin’s Time on Board Perry’s Flagship: An Entry in the Logbook of the Powhatan Related to the Shimoda Stowaway), Higashi Ajia bunka kōshō kenkyū (Institute for Cultural Interaction Studies, Kansai University), no. 3 (March 2010).
respectively, marking the 150th anniversary of Perry’s first visit to Japan and the opening of Yokohama as a treaty port, I tried to break with existing nationalistic thinking and interpretations of the first U.S.-Japan encounter, as revealed in the alleged white-flag 白旗 incident and the view of the petition as a ruse for attack. Supposedly, Perry, in anticipation of possible hostilities, passed two white flags to the Japanese side for them to surrender with. He thus, insultingly, sought to teach the Japanese to act in a civilized manner. In the view of the petition as a ruse for attack 墨夷膺懲, Shōin’s alleged real purpose in pretending to be a stowaway was to kill Perry and punish the Americans. Shōin is here portrayed as a patriotic terrorist.9

But what I found, on the contrary, was a story that exemplified the fact that humanitarian concerns did matter in the age of imperialism and nationalism. The evidence for this view can be found in three interrelated documents.

- In the kanbun version of the first petition copied by Luo, I found a Confucian term 仁厚愛物之意, meaning “kindness, generosity, and love of other beings,” which could be compared to the concepts of humanism and tolerance in modern Western thought. The term appeared twice, first in the sentence “We are fully assured of the kindness and liberality of your excel-lencies, and your regard for others,” and later in the sentence “If this matter should become known, we should uselessly see ourselves pursued and brought back for immediate execution without fail, and such a result would greatly grieve the deep humanity and kindness you all bear towards others.”
- Shōin was then a twenty-five-year-old young man, and his petition had been polished by his mentor Sakuma Shōzan 佐久間象山 (1811–1864), a leading scholar of Chinese and Dutch learning who strongly encouraged Shōin to go abroad to study advanced Western military technology. It seemed that the appeal to the humanity of Perry and his team was both strategic and effective. When Perry got to know the miserable situation of Shōin and his companion in the cage, he sent his Flag Lieutenant Silas Bent and

---

Williams the following morning, only to find that the two had just been transferred to a jail in Edo. Out of serious concern over the possible beheading that Shōin had warned him of in the first petition, Perry decided to exert his influence. The Narrative describes his intervention as follows. “The fate of the poor fellows was never ascertained, but it is hoped that the authorities were more merciful than to have awarded the severest penalty, which was the loss of their heads, for what appears to us only liberal and a highly commendable curiosity, however great the crime according to the eccentric and sanguinary code of Japanese law. It is a comfort to be able to add, that the Commodore received an assurance from the authorities, upon questioning them, that he need not apprehend a serious termination.”¹⁰ The assurance was apparently a relief to Perry, who faced a difficult choice between national interest and human rights.

• According to Bokui ōsetsu roku 墨夷應接録 (Record of Negotiations with the Americans), compiled by the Bakufu’s diplomatic team, Perry proudly boasted that respect for and rescuing the lives of people had been the major concern and policy of the American government.¹¹ He severely criticized the Bakufu for its inhumane treatment of American shipwrecked whalers and Japanese sailors who drifted abroad owing to storms. (In the 1840s and 1850s there were hundreds of American whalers operating in Japanese waters. Once a whaler was shipwrecked, the surviving castaways would be brought by the current to southern Ezochi. From there they were escorted by foot to Nagasaki, where they awaited ships of the Dutch East India Company, arriving on the monsoon current, to transport them to Batavia [present-day Jakarta]. There they would be picked up by American rescue ships. Also, surprisingly, Japanese sailors who drifted abroad because of storms were denied rights of repatriation to prevent any possible Christian influence.)¹²

¹⁰ Hawkes, Narrative, 1: 423.
¹² During the eighteenth century, there developed a system of mutual aid between Tokugawa Japan, Qing China, Yi Korea, and Vietnam, in which each country agreed to help shipwrecked fishermen repair their boats, to provide them with food and other necessities, and to send them home. However, this arrangement did not apply to Westerners. In 1837 Williams and several other American missionaries headed to Japan from Canton on the American merchant ship Morrison in an attempt to repatriate seven Japanese shipwrecked sailors. However, they were driven away by cannon fire, first at Uraga Bay, and later at Kagoshima Bay, in accordance with the Edict to Repel Foreign Vessels 無二念打拂令 of 1825.
When I was investigating these sources, I was surprised to find stones that could be turned to gold, that is, important lines and critical facts, overlooked by scholars, that could be evaluated in the new light of humanitari-anism. Line (4) thus recognizes the importance of refining one’s awareness of the question itself by approaching the object from different angles and perspectives.

4 Make Your Moon Whole by Making Sense of the Rays and Shadows

To sum up, as the Chinese proverb 自圓其說 implies, the task of a researcher is to discern a path from all the possible sources of information and shape it into some sort of argument. This task is similar to piecing together the fragmented light that shines through the leaves to re-create a full moon, much like solving a jigsaw puzzle. Line 1 thus points out our limited capabilities in the face of the grandness of nature and the universe. Yet it also fully recognizes the possibility that we can deepen our understanding of both the external and internal worlds.

Many proverbs, taken literally, invite pessimism. But it is important to maintain a positive attitude toward what is admittedly a difficult field. For example, 二兎を追う者は一兎を得ず (One who chases two rabbits at the same time catches neither) instills a negative lesson, but in line (3) I change this negative lesson into a positive suggestion: 兩個兔子輪番追 (Chase two rabbits in turn). The line ends with 有意插柳 (Plant a willow with purpose). This derives from the Chinese proverb 有意栽花，花不开；無心插柳，柳成蔭 (A watched flower never blooms, but an untended willow thrives). Here too I made a positive change to remind scholars of the importance of always being attentive in their research, as the second rabbit they encounter might be a decisive clue that helps them develop their second or third areas of interest. A scholar needs three or more areas of expertise to establish scholarly credentials and research style, as suggested by the Chinese proverb 三足鼎立 (The Chinese cauldron stands on three legs).

Appendixes

The First Petition (translated by S. W. Williams)

Two scholars from Yedo, in Japan, present this letter for the inspection of the “high officers and those who manage affairs.” Our attainments are few and trifling, as we ourselves are small and unimportant, so that we are abashed in coming before you; we are neither skilled in the use of arms, nor are we able to discourse upon the rules of strategy and military discipline; in trifling pursuits and idle pastimes our years and months have slipped away. We have,
however, read in [Chinese] books, and learned a little by hearsay, what are 
the customs and education in Europe and America, and we have been for 
many years desirous of going over the “five great continents,” but the laws of 
our country in all maritime points are very strict; for foreigners to come into 
the country, and for natives to go abroad, are both immutably forbidden. Our 
wish to visit other regions has consequently only “gone to and fro in our own 
breasts in continual agitation,” like one’s breathing being impeded or his 
walking cramped. Happily, the arrival of so many of your ships in these 
waters, and stay for so many days, which has given us opportunity to make a 
pleasing acquaintance and careful examination, so that we are fully assured of 
the kindness and liberality of your excellencies, and your regard for others, 
has also revived the thoughts of many years, and they are urgent for an exit. 

This, then, is the time to carry the plan into execution, and we now secretly 
send you this private request, that you will take us on board your ships as 
they go out to sea; we can thus visit around in the five great continents, even 
if we do in this, slight the prohibitions of our own country. Lest those who 
have the management of affairs may feel some chagrin at this, in order to 
effect our desire, we are willing to serve in any way we can on board of the 
ships, and obey the orders given us. For doubtless it is, that when a lame man 
sees others walking he wishes to walk too; but how shall the pedestrian 
gratify his desires when he sees another one riding? We have all our lives 
been going hither to you, unable to get more than thirty degrees east and 
west, or twenty-five degrees north and south; but now when we see how you 
sail on the tempests and cleave the huge billows, going lightning speed thou-
sands and myriads of miles, skirting along the five great continents, can it not 
be likened to the lame finding a plan for walking, and the pedestrian seeing a 
mode by which he can ride? If you who manage affairs will give our request 
your consideration, we will retain the sense of the favor; but the prohibitions 
of our country are still existent, and if this matter should become known we 
should uselessly see ourselves pursued and brought back for immediate 
exection without fail, and such a result would greatly grieve the deep 
humanity and kindness you all bear towards others. If you are willing to 
accede to this request, keep “wrapped in silence our error in making it” until 
you are about to leave, in order to avoid all risk of such serious danger to 
life; for when, bye-and-bye, we come back, our countrymen will never think 
it worthwhile to investigate bygone doings. Although our words have only 
loosely let our thoughts leak out, yet truly they are sincere; and if your 
excellencies are pleased to regard them kindly, do not doubt them nor oppose 
our wishes. We together pay our respects in handing this in. April 11 [1854]. 
(Hawkes, Narrative, 1: 420.)
The sōrōbun note (translated by the author)
We two want to see the world. Please allow us to board your ship in secrecy. Going to foreign countries, however, is strictly prohibited in Japan. We would be in deep trouble if you tell the Japanese officers about this. If your admiral were to consent to our intention, we hope that you will send a barge at midnight tomorrow to the shore of Kakizaki village to meet us. April 19 [1854]. Ichigi Kōda, Kwanouchi Manji

The Second Petition (translated by S. W. Williams)
When a hero fails in his purpose, his acts are then regarded as those of a villain and robber. In public have we been seized and pinioned and caged for many days. The village elders and head men treat us disdainfully, their oppressions being grievous indeed. Therefore, looking up while yet we have nothing wherewith to reproach ourselves, it must now be seen whether a hero will prove himself to be one indeed. Regarding the liberty of going through the sixty States [of Japan] as not enough for our desires, we wished to make the circuit of the five great continents. This was our hearts’ wish for a long time. Suddenly our plans are defeated, and we find ourselves in a half sized house, where eating, resting, sitting, and sleeping are difficult; how can we find our exit from this place? Weeping, we seem as fools; laughing, as rogues. Alas! for us; silent we can only be. (Hawkes, Narrative, 1: 422ff.)

Illustrations

(1) Yoshida Shōin in Shimoda
A fan inscribed with friendly words including Confucian world view by Luo Sen and S. W. Williams.

Luo Sen’s poem describes the powerful black ships and the beautiful landscape of Ryūkyū and Japan.
Turning Stone into Gold: My Research about the 1854 Shōin-Perry Encounter

(7) Yoshida Shōin

(8) Commodore M. C. Perry

(9) Perry's flagship, the USS Powhatan

(10) Record of Shōin's time onboard in the logbook of the Powhatan
(11) The First Petition

(12) The sōrōbun note

(13) The Second Petition

Note: The paper was given at “Treasures from Japan: An International Conference on Pre-modern Books and Manuscripts in the Yale University Library,” on March 5–6, 2015, sponsored by the Council on East Asian Studies, the Beinecke Rare Book & Manuscript Library, and the East Asian Library, in cooperation with the Historiographical Institute (University of Tokyo) and the National Institutes for the Humanities (Japan).

Illustrations (5) & (6): Courtesy of Hakodate City Museum.